Anecdote 1. Beginning in 1998/99, I began an experiment in assessment with my pre-service teacher candidates at OISE/UT, (post graduate BEd) based on what I believed to be the principles defined in *Ontario Curriculum Grades 9-12, Program Planning and Assessment*. The main reason for sharing this good news story is that assessment practice like this can be used and be successful at any level. Sometimes common belief about assessment practice of university instructors can inhibit change in secondary schools as teachers “prepare their students for university”. Contrary to commonly held beliefs, a wide range of tools and strategies are employed to assess student growth and performance in post secondary institutions. At the outset, I asked myself the central question ... what does assessment practice designed to improve student learning* look like? The following outlines practices refined over four years:

• Students were given all the major assignments along with the assessment tool used for each in the previous year on day one of the course;

• Due dates were negotiated. Students could request extensions with cause without penalty. The emphasis was always on best possible results;

• Conferences were available on request and were required for major assignments;

• Class work in preparation for the assignment included small group assessment of exemplars collected from peers in earlier classes using the criteria on which their work would be assessed;

• There was class discussion of the, assessment criteria and tool, usually a rubric or scale. Suggestions for change were solicited;

• Feedback was provided using the rubric or scale by circling appropriate descriptors of performance. An anecdotal summary of the assignment’s strengths was offered as well as some specific suggestion for improvement. No grades or marks were assigned for any work. Students were encouraged to discuss the feedback and to resubmit their work for reappraisal;

• Self assessment and reflection was an element in most and feedback from experienced teachers was encouraged. Students were also encouraged to share their work on the class electronic conference;

• Copies of all rubrics and scales were kept on file for purposes of final grade determination. Selected exemplars were added to the class file;

• At the end of the school year, all the evidence of student performance was considered. Particular emphasis was attached to most recent and most consistent performance. A final grade was awarded for the course in accordance with university policy.
I believe that the whole assessment process was much more transparent and that students were much more involved in the process of learning from their experience. Discussions of performance were couched in criterion based language. There were few extension requests and those who chose, felt comfortable in resubmitting their work. No one questioned “fairness” as all students had the same opportunities to improve their work. Assessment was more of a shared experience and the class climate was less confrontational. The products were superior. The one problem area for some was confronting work sharing issues within group settings. More work needs to be done on this aspect of assessment. (F. Taylor)

Anecdote 2. A second good news assessment and evaluation process was a project on Genetically Modified Organisms. This assignment can be done in grade 9 Geography, grade 12 World Issues, or grade 10 History or Civics. It was used with a class at a secondary school in Toronto. The project was set up as a debate. There are two sides to the debate, pro and con GMO labeling in Canada. Students choose a card as they enter the classroom for the day. On the card they find their role and the perspective from which they approach the issue. For example, there is a pro GMO labeling farmer, and a con labeling GMO farmer, a pro GMO grocery store owner, and a con GMO multi-national business person (Monsanto), etc. Each role is comprised of two to three students who work cooperatively to find and disseminate information. Initially all groups are given folders with newspaper clippings, and other primary source materials, to get them started. After compiling arguments based on their folders, they move to the library or computer lab to search the Internet and to further assemble information, or fill in gaps. Cooperative group skills such as listening, sharing ideas and encouraging each other are discussed and decoded using see and say charts*. These skills are then assessed daily by the teacher using observational charts as the students work on their project. The students also receive feedback on the research process in the form of an assessment grade and anecdotal comments to help guide them if they are off-track. The student debate is a venue for informal peer assessment. Students receive some coaching on debating skills. In formal debate style, students each take turns making points based on their research. Their peers then assess and critique their points in debate style. Following the debate, as a culminating performance evaluation activity, students are asked to write a letter to the Prime Minister of Canada, supporting either pro or con GMO labeling. This letter is formally evaluated for form and content with the option to rewrite the letter as many times as they want before a final grade is assigned. Samples of assessment tools used in this assignment can be found in Appendix 1 on pages 23 to 25.

In the beginning, I was worried the students would not engage fully in the activities since the preliminary portion of the project did not involve formal evaluation, but simply preliminary assessment. I was gratified to see, however, that students took on the project with enthusiasm. This could have been a result of the appeal of the topic, the variety of tasks, or the cooperative nature of the activity, but I also believe that students felt less pressured to perform in the formative stages, and therefore took more risks in learning. In the formal evaluation stage, I was encouraged to see that students had learned from the initial portion of the project, from both teacher feedback and peer assessment during debate, which they applied in their final letter writing performance task. Some students took the option to rewrite their letters to improve their grades. I feel this option provided an opportunity for those students who didn’t achieve their desired result to learn material they would otherwise have missed. If our goal as teachers is for our students to learn, then providing these opportunities for them to redo something, and finally ‘get it’ is invaluable. In certain situations providing formal evaluation for all portions of the project may be necessary, and could easily be incorporated into the project. In my opinion, though, evaluating the final portion of the project as an independent exercise carried out in class
can lead to a more fair assessment of whether the student has learned the material or not, than trying to evaluate the entire group project when students are still in the formative stages of learning, as some students will need to rely more heavily on the group initially. (L. Kuchirka)

**Thinking about assessment and global citizenship**

The *purpose* of assessment is to *improve student learning*. Learning is the “stuff” that lasts … that travels … that will leave with students and be extended when the course is through. Improving student learning is the litmus for testing our assessment behaviours. Is what we do day to day consistent with this end? The focus of this resource is educating for global citizenship. Involving students in the process of assessing their own work is an excellent way to foster civic and global responsibility. Our daily practice can be consistent with the attitudes, skills and knowledge we hope to develop and foster in a global citizen. The two good news stories shared above attempt to make assessment inclusive and transparent. Assessment in these cases is used to engage students in the process of learning.

The literature on assessment is formidable in its volume and in its probity, yet no aspect of school practice is as impervious to change as this most critical element. Grant Wiggins’ reference to assessment as the *Trojan Horse of real* school change is an image worth pursuing. Perhaps, educating for global citizenship offers a means to this end because students are so easily genuinely engaged in learning because the issues are real. Among those who might influence and guide a transition in assessment practice is Ken O’Connor who has written a very practical, teacher friendly workbook, *How To Grade For Learning* that forces the reader to confront daily practice. O’Connor uses case studies, those we have all encountered, to help us reflect on current assessment and evaluation methodology. He lays out alternatives providing clear examples, then challenges us to at least consider making changes. Not to be missed is Chapter 5, *Crunching Numbers*.

Another thoughtful favourite is Ruth Sutton who captures the essence of *less is more* in her very readable 170 page book, *Assessment For Learning*. In Chapter 4, Ruth says, Looking back on my years in the classroom, I’m not happy about the way I approached marking as a secondary teacher. I was clear that marking should give my pupils feedback about their work so that they could improve it next time, but I was overwhelmed by the sheer quantity of it, not always clear about what I was looking for, and often distracted by the cosmetics of presentation rather than the knowledge and understanding which took a little longer to spot. Many of us could have written this as we have had very similar thoughts. Ruth writes in the vernacular and offers useful suggestions in this chapter entitled, *Marking* or on-going assessment and record keeping.

An early and profound influence in our own transition is the work of Alfie Kohn. He writes disturbing stuff under titles like *Punished By Rewards* and *Grading: The Issue Is Not How but Why*. The latter is a four page “must read” for all teachers in which Kohn critically analyses the accepted rationales for grading then offers a vision for a supportive alternative.

Are the stakes high in the assessment enterprise? Richard Stiggins suggests ...

If we mismeasure achievement, we might fail to identify important learner needs, group students inappropriately, place faith in instructional strategies that really don’t work,
assign inaccurate grades, leave students with a sense of failure when they really succeeded, or leave students feeling successful when they really failed. In short, we place students directly in harms way.

All of these and many others have designed practical, usable strategies that could allow us to align what we do in assessing student work with what we articulate as our goals in assessing the products and process of learning.

In order to accomplish improved learning, teachers might …
• make students partners in the enterprise rather than dependents;
• make assessment more about information for students … about how they’re doing, and less about numbers, letters and judgements;
• believe that less is more.

Changing behaviours is difficult for students and teachers. However, we should remember that the old saying You can’t teach an old dog new tricks was written by an old dog. We have become conditioned to letters and numbers. Alfie Kohn calls this pop behaviouralism …

Do this and you’ll get that … The wisdom of this technique is rarely held up for inspection; all that is open to question is what exactly people will receive and under what circumstances it will be promised and delivered.⁶

Is this how the real world works? Is this how we want it to work? Do businesses and institutions want people who will only work when there is a reward or the threat of sanction? Most teachers are horrified at the thought, yet are day to day classroom practices consistent with the desired end of a self motivated, independent thinker?

Assessing For Student Success

Assessing for success is different from marking. The difference lies in the distinction between formative assessment and summative assessment or evaluation. The former places emphasis on gathering information on student performance and providing feedback and encouragement designed to improve performance. Ideally, the great majority of assessment is formative. Summative assessment or evaluation involves making judgments based on the evidence collected. Because a mark or grade implies a judgment, work graded or marked is seen by students as summative. Although judgments should be made based on all the evidence available, a summative assessment task or test is most appropriate at the end of a unit or course to provide students with an opportunity to demonstrate what has been learned.

Positive constructive assessment practice …
• assesses achievement and performance on assigned tasks, and assesses behaviours separately;
• assesses learning expectations or desired outcomes;
• is selective in what is assessed … quality in selection not quantity;
• employs a variety of assessment types and tools … the most appropriate tool for the task;
• accurately reflects individual performance;
• accommodates for individual needs including exceptional students;
• emphasizes intrinsic rewards;
• involves students in a discussion of assessment criteria;
• describes clearly what success looks like. What is the Standard?
• provides assessment criteria and descriptors with the assignment including exemplars …examples of successful student work; and
• provides peer or teacher comment…feedback, lots and lots of feedback, particularly on first drafts or attempts.
## Assessment Tools and Their Use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tools</th>
<th>Rubric and Rating Scales</th>
<th>Observation Forms and Checklists</th>
<th>Reflection</th>
<th>Quiz</th>
<th>Test/Exam</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and Understanding</td>
<td>Assess depth and breadth of research as for an authentic task, debate, report, essay</td>
<td></td>
<td>Used for making personal meaning ...connecting to existing knowledge</td>
<td>Asses factual recall objective type questions... short answer type, multiple choice, fill in the blanks, matching, true/false</td>
<td>Assess knowledge in essay and short answer type questions... analyze, synthesize, evaluate, extend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking and Inquiry</td>
<td>Assess skill in problem solving and decision making</td>
<td>Assess task skills and inquiry process ...checkpoints in completing work</td>
<td>Assess information and making personal meaning</td>
<td>For dialogue or to provide feedback on expressed opinions, feelings or perspective</td>
<td>Assess methodology, interpretation, analysis and application</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Assess oral and written communication skills ...language use, organization, presentation, effect as well as products ...web site, brochure, story, fable, essay. Use of props and aids...photos, charts, graphics, software.</td>
<td></td>
<td>For dialogue or to provide feedback on expressed opinions, feelings or perspective</td>
<td></td>
<td>Assess writing component for essay type answers and oral exams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Application and Making Connections</td>
<td>Assess culminating events or tasks and alternative final assessments... complex authentic tasks incorporating all of the above, also role play, simulation</td>
<td></td>
<td>Used when evaluating and applying knowledge and understanding in other familiar and different contexts</td>
<td></td>
<td>Assess essay type simulation questions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Performance (Authentic) Tasks:

Each chapter in this resource outlines three teaching strategies, many of which are performance tasks. Some provide opportunities for students to become actively involved in civic action and with developing and fostering global citizenship, designed to increase civic literacy. Awareness of individuals who make a difference is very important in reinforcing the on-going theme of the power of one that is so critical in citizenship education. Timely issues like those related to environmental stewardship easily hook students. The concept of ecozone is new and is very attractive as it takes a much more holistic approach to the environment that just makes sense allowing students to see connections between setting, issues and actions that individuals can take.

- You are to create a “biography box” that represents the life of a prominent person who has had a profound influence on the quality of life of people through humanitarian work in her/his community (local to global). You will present your appropriately decorated box with its minimum of 8 artifacts representing the person’s contributions and accomplishments to the teacher librarian of Anyplace S.S. Your box will be added to the resource collection for use by students in future research projects.

- You are to create an illustrated story (a picture book) for a grade 1 audience set in one of Canada’s ecozones. Your story must demonstrate an understanding of all of the components of the ecozone and their interrelationships. You must use computer software in creating your story. You will read your story to grade one students in a local feeder school.

Some examples of many authentic tasks that are outlined in the following chapters include...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An Action Report on becoming a global citizen that includes a range of 5 actions a student might take ... select one and do it</td>
<td>Chapter 1, Strategy 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Take the Human Rights Temperature of your school</td>
<td>Chapter 3, Strategy 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship lab ... researching an issue and developing and implementing action strategies to be shared at a Civics Fair</td>
<td>Chapter 6, Strategy 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop and implement a “Fair Wear” policy for your school</td>
<td>Chapter 7, Strategy 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct mandatory community service work with a global agency or organization</td>
<td>Chapter 8, Strategy 1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the pages that follow, assessment tools for the two tasks above will be developed as models for the type of tools that will accompany many of the activities introduced in each chapter. Other samples are offered to demonstrate different scale formats. In all cases, we will be attempting to ensure that our assessment practice is consistent with our citizenship intent.

Assessment Rubrics and Rating Scales:

A rubric is a special kind of scale for assessing student work. A rubric answers the question …what does success … and varying degrees of success look like? A typical rubric contains a scale of possible levels of performance ranging from level 1 (considerable work necessary to reach the standard) to Level 4 (exceeds the standard). It provides clear descriptors for each level of performance.

A rating scale is a device used to assess student work against criteria. It is different from a rubric in that it describes a successful performance with varying degrees of detail, from the criteria alone to
detailed descriptions similar to those found in Level 3 in a rubric. The scale may rate several levels of performance, but only one is described. Like rubrics, rating scales provide performance feedback for students.

**Why Use Rubrics?**

A good rubric …

• clearly establishes the criteria for assessment;
• defines the standard … a Level 3 performance and answers the question for students, What does success look like;
• establishes a reasonable standard, one achievable by all students being assessed using the rubric;
• has a scale of levels of performance…ranging from Level 4, representing the top level of performance to Level 1, representing a level of performance not yet at standard;
• has detailed, clear descriptors for each criterion at each of the 4 levels of performance…what the work or each performance looks like;
• has descriptors that define differences in performance of the same element across the 4 levels of performance;
• provides examples for clarity where needed;
• clearly establishes the difference in performance from one level to the next in even increments;
• describes performance using positive, constructive language;
• makes provision for suggestions for improvement;
• promotes consistency and accuracy in assessing student work;
• provides the language and the focus for detailed discussion of student work.

We can take much of the mystery out of constructing rubrics. Those on the following pages exhibit a variety of styles and formats. In all cases, we have placed the highest level of performance first because this represents what students might strive for … “This is what your project/task might look like”. There is no consensus on this question. In fact, most start with Level 1. It is a matter of choice. There is also no magic in four levels. It is what is done in this jurisdiction. Grant Wiggins, among others prefers an odd number of levels in his rubrics. Given that we wish to be positive and constructive, we would never include a level describing a student performance that, in fact, means failure. The assumption is that all students will demonstrate a level of achievement of the assessment criteria. Should a student not do so for a few of the elements being assessed, I think it more constructive to not circle any descriptor on that line. This would automatically trigger a student conference.

In all cases, it is the Overall Expectations being assessed. We suggest inserting the learning expectations being assessed at the top of the page, between the title and the rubric itself. Rubric and scale construction is a necessary skill for all teachers. Following the steps below and using examples provided should make the task very much easier and result in a superior product.

In courses emphasizing citizenship, students should assume responsibility for assessing their own work. For them to assess their work and that of others successfully, they will need to be trained. They will need to learn the meaning of the words we use in assessment. What does “sharing ideas” look like; sound like? See pages 23 and 24 for two samples. Students can be taught to construct their own rubrics and scales. One way to accomplish this is to provide a partially completed rubric that students can complete working together in small groups, and then, as a whole class. We have
included a sample of such a rubric as a model. I suggest that students not be asked to contribute to
rubric construction until after they have some experience with teacher generated scales.

Four rubrics have been developed in Chapter 8. Three of them provide detailed feedback for students
working on the *Civic Action Inquiry Project*. The fourth is a presentation rubric for the *Civics Fair*.

**Suggested Steps In Developing A Rubric**

- Decide what students will learn. What expectations/results/outcomes will be demonstrated? Include
  them on the rubric.
- Create a task that will allow students to demonstrate achievement of these expectations. Rubrics are
  best used for complex authentic tasks or to show growth in important skill areas where students will
  be provided with multiple opportunities to show growth.
- Identify criteria for assessing the task, for example, process (research, task skills), product (content,
  organization, creativity, presentation, communication).
- Keep several samples of student work to help in the development of descriptors for each criterion
  and for students to refer to as the work progresses.
- Completely describe what success looks like for each criterion. Use the samples to assist in the
  writing of clear, concise descriptors. Create “lines” for individual descriptors, and provide examples
  to add clarity.
- Describe performance for each criterion at each of the other levels keeping language consistent
  along the line, but making a clear distinction from level to level.
- Present the rubric to students along with the samples of successful student work when the task is
  introduced. Discuss each criterion and all descriptors using the samples to add clarity. Solicit
  suggestions from students to improve the rubric and make any changes suggested.
A Rubric For ... Writing A Letter

Learning Expectations/Results/Outcomes:

Students will...

- articulate clearly their personal sense of civic identity and purpose, and understand the diversity of beliefs and values of other individuals and groups in Canadian society
- demonstrate an ability to research questions and issues of civic importance and to think critically and creatively about these issues and questions
- demonstrate an ability to apply decision making and conflict resolution procedures and skills to cases of civic importance
- communicate the results of an inquiry using appropriate methods and technologies, and present viewpoints on issues affecting Canadians

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Level 4 Achieves the standard with distinction</th>
<th>Level 3 Achieves the standard</th>
<th>Level 2 Close to achieving the standard</th>
<th>Level 1 Has not yet achieved the standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge and Understanding</td>
<td>Writer makes detailed reference to documented evidence in building her/his case</td>
<td>Writer analyses the impact of government policy on individuals and on communities</td>
<td>Writer makes some reference to documented evidence in building her/his case</td>
<td>Little reference is made to the impact of government policy on individuals and on communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Writer makes effective use of reference to current events in building his/her case</td>
<td></td>
<td>Writer makes some reference to current global events in building his/her case</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thinking/Inquiry</td>
<td>Writer develops a convincing case in support of her/his point of view</td>
<td></td>
<td>Writer has yet to develop a case in support of a point of view</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Writer develops arguments by producing a variety (4 or more) of types of evidence, for e.g. Statistics, case studies, quotes, personal experience</td>
<td>Writer develops arguments by producing 2 types of evidence, for e.g. Statistics, case studies, quotes, personal experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>Writer makes very few spelling or grammar errors</td>
<td>Writer organizes arguments and evidence for maximum effect.</td>
<td>Writer organizes arguments and evidence with some effect</td>
<td>Writer makes many spelling or grammar errors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Rubric For ... An Ecozone Story

**Expectations:** Students will...
- demonstrate an understanding of spatial organization ... place, location, region
- describe selected Canadian ecozones and identify the processes that shape them
- demonstrate an ability to collect, organize and synthesize information from a variety of sources
- select and use appropriate methods and technology to communicate the results of an inquiry and present a variety of viewpoints on issues affecting Canadians

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Level 4 Achieves the standard with distinction</th>
<th>Level 3 Achieves the Standard</th>
<th>Level 2 Close to achieving the standard</th>
<th>Level 1 Has not yet achieved the standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Knowledge and Understanding</strong></td>
<td>You describe the ecozone setting completely and accurately illustrate it in your story</td>
<td>You describe the ecozone setting and accurately illustrate it in your story</td>
<td>You describe the ecozone setting and illustrate it in your story</td>
<td>Your description of the ecozone setting and your illustrations need more detail or greater accuracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Your story and illustrations show a clear and logical relationship between the main character and the environment (ecozone)</td>
<td>Your story and illustrations show a clear relationship between the main character and the environment (ecozone)</td>
<td>Your story and illustrations show some relationship between the main character and the environment (ecozone)</td>
<td>Your story and illustrations are either missing important relationships or the relationships are unclear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Your story contains many references to processes that shape the ecozone</td>
<td>Your story contains some reference to processes that shape the ecozone</td>
<td>Your story contains few references to processes that shape the ecozone</td>
<td>Your story needs more references to processes that shape the ecozone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Thinking and Inquiry</strong></td>
<td>Your research draws from a rich variety of resource types. Four or more are used</td>
<td>Your research draws from a variety of resource types. Three are used</td>
<td>Your research draws from two different types of resources</td>
<td>Your research relies on a single resource</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication</strong></td>
<td>Your story has all of the components of a short story</td>
<td>Your story has most of the components of a short story</td>
<td>Your story has some of the components of a short story</td>
<td>Your story needs more of the components of a short story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Your story is very well written and has no grammar or spelling errors</td>
<td>Your story is well written and has no grammar or spelling errors</td>
<td>Your story has no grammar or spelling errors</td>
<td>Your story has some grammar and spelling errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There is a creative and clever integration of text and illustrations on most pages</td>
<td>There is a clear relationship between the illustrations and the text on all pages</td>
<td>There is a relationship between the illustrations and the text on most pages</td>
<td>There is some relationship between the illustrations and the text on some pages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creativity</strong></td>
<td>All illustrations are very colorful and imaginative</td>
<td>Most illustrations are colorful and imaginative</td>
<td>Some illustrations are colorful and imaginative</td>
<td>Illustrations need more color and imagination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# A Rubric To Assess … A Biography Box

**Expectations:** Students will…
- demonstrate an ability to research questions and issues of civic importance and to think critically and creatively about these issues and questions
- demonstrate a knowledge of different types of citizenship, participation and involvement
- examine beliefs and values underlying democratic citizenship and explain how these beliefs and values guide citizens’ actions
- explain how global economic, cultural and environmental factors affect individual career and lifestyle opportunities
- demonstrate an understanding of citizenship within a global context

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Level 4 Achieves the standard with distinction</th>
<th>Level 3 Achieves the Standard</th>
<th>Level 2 Close to achieving the standard</th>
<th>Level 1 Has not yet achieved the standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Thinking/ Inquiry</strong></td>
<td>I recorded information from a variety of secondary print and electronic resources and media</td>
<td>I recorded information from a variety of well chosen secondary print and electronic resources and media</td>
<td>I recorded information from a variety of secondary print and electronic resources and media</td>
<td>I recorded information from a variety of secondary print or electronic resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I assess the value and relevance of information using only the most appropriate for my purpose</td>
<td>I assess the value and relevance of information; most is appropriate for my purpose</td>
<td>I assess the value and relevance of information; much is appropriate for my purpose</td>
<td>I had some difficulty assessing the value and relevance of information; little is appropriate for my purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I document with very convincing evidence using 4 or more different types... specific examples, anecdotes, statistics, quotes, observations, measurements, artifacts</td>
<td>I document with convincing evidence using 3 different types</td>
<td>I document with evidence using 3 different types</td>
<td>I document with evidence using 2 different types</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Knowledge/ Understanding</strong></th>
<th>The person I chose easily meets all of the environmental selection criteria</th>
<th>The person I chose meets all of the environmental selection criteria</th>
<th>The person I chose meets most of the environmental selection criteria</th>
<th>The person I chose meets a few of the environmental selection criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clear, consistent connections are made among career, lifestyle and environmental contributions</td>
<td>Clear connections are made among career, lifestyle and environmental contributions</td>
<td>Some clear connections are made among career, lifestyle and environmental contributions</td>
<td>Few clear connections are made among career, lifestyle and environmental contributions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All of the symbols, analogies or metaphors I create to represent the researched information are appropriate and imaginative</td>
<td>Most of the symbols, analogies or metaphors I create to represent the information are appropriate and imaginative</td>
<td>Most of the symbols, analogies or metaphors I create to represent the information are appropriate</td>
<td>Some of the symbols, analogies or metaphors I create to represent the information are appropriate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria</td>
<td>Level 4 Achieves the standard with distinction</td>
<td>Level 3 Achieves the Standard</td>
<td>Level 2 Close to achieving the standard</td>
<td>Level 1 Has not yet achieved the standard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Communication</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I communicate information in a wide variety of formats ...5 or more of reports, letters, anecdotes, graphs, charts, maps, photos, diagrams, symbols</td>
<td>I communicate information in a wide variety of formats ...4 formats used</td>
<td>I communicate information in a variety of formats ...3 formats used</td>
<td>I communicate information using 2 formats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I speak clearly and correctly with authority and confidence. I use no notes; strong varied voice; full eye contact. I have relaxed posture and move freely about the presentation space</td>
<td>I speak clearly and correctly. I use few notes, strong voice, partial eye contact. I am relaxed for much of the presentation and move away from the desk and notes some of the time</td>
<td>I speak clearly and correctly for most of the presentation. I use notes for much of it. My voice is strong for most of the presentation. I make little eye contact and move little. I’m a little nervous</td>
<td>I speak correctly for most of the presentation. I use notes for most of it. My voice is strong for much of the presentation. I make little or no eye contact and stay close to my notes. I’m nervous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I engage my audience throughout my presentation... many questions posed</td>
<td>I engage my audience through most of my presentation... some questions posed</td>
<td>I engage my audience through some of my presentation... few questions posed</td>
<td>I had difficulty engaging my audience through most of my presentation ...no questions posed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### A Rubric For A Field Study... A Photo Essay ...Holistic Format

**Expectations:** Students will…
- analyse the ways in which natural systems interact with human systems, then make predictions about the outcomes of these interactions
- demonstrate an ability to research questions and issues of civic importance and to think critically about these issues and questions
- communicate the results of an inquiry using appropriate methods and technologies, and present viewpoints on issues affecting the community
- articulate clearly their personal sense of civic identity and purpose and understand the diversity of beliefs of other individuals and groups
- demonstrate an ability to collaborate effectively when participating in group inquiries and community activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Level 4 field study to produce a photo essay is characterized by the following:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All checkpoint requirements and teacher conferences were made on time. The photo essay has a clearly identified theme and delivers a relevant and significant message with considerable impact. Every photo selected relates to the theme and contributes to the message. The photos reveal field study with considerable breadth and depth, for example, the whole community is represented; enough photos are included to make a convincing case; significant community characteristics are represented, for example, the landscape, land uses, human activities, the people, buildings, contemporary and historic dimensions. Captions accompany every photograph and all engage the reader, for example captions ask or raise questions; reveal reflection and insight related to the subject of the photo. Photographs are technically superior. Each photo has a clear focus, excludes unwanted or extraneous detail, and is properly exposed. Photographs are thoughtfully sequenced; there is an obvious plan that enhances the message of the photo essay. The photo essay is attractively, effectively and creatively packaged, for example, use of computer software, colour, graphics, unique design elements.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Level 3 field study to produce a photo essay is characterized by the following:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most checkpoint requirements and teacher conferences were made on time. The photo essay has a theme and delivers a relevant and significant message with some impact. Most photos selected relate to the theme and contribute to the message. The photos reveal field study with some breadth and depth. Captions accompany every photograph and some engage the reader. Most photographs are technically excellent. Most photos have a clear focus, exclude unwanted or extraneous detail, and are properly exposed. Photographs are sequenced; there is an obvious plan. The photo essay is attractively and effectively packaged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Level 2 field study to produce a photo essay is characterized by the following:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Some checkpoint requirements and teacher conferences were made on time. The photo essay has a theme and delivers a message with some impact. Most photos selected relate to the theme or contribute to the message. The photos reveal field study with some breadth or depth. Captions accompany every photograph. Photographs are technically good. Some photos have a clear focus, exclude unwanted or extraneous detail, and are properly exposed. Some photographs are sequenced; there is some evidence of a plan. The photo essay is attractively packaged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A Level 1 field study to produce a photo essay is characterized by the following:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Few checkpoint requirements and teacher conferences were made on time. The photo essay has a theme and delivers a message; Some photos selected relate to the theme and contribute to the message. The photos reveal field study with little breadth or depth. Captions accompany most photographs. Some photographs are technically good. Few photos have a clear focus, exclude unwanted or extraneous detail, and are properly exposed. Some photographs are sequenced. Elements of the photo essay are attractively packaged.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Rating Scale For An Inquiry Task...A Primary Research Project

Expectations: Students will...
- synthesize information on changes in the chosen community in order to identify issues and plan for the future
- collect, organize and synthesize information about the characteristics of the community from a variety of sources
- communicate the results of the inquiry using appropriate methods and technologies, and present viewpoints on issues affecting members of the community

Social, cultural, economic character of Someplace High and Vocational School
In my research project,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Achieves the standard with distinction</th>
<th>Not yet achieving the standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

answer a clear question about the social, cultural and/or economic behaviour or character of the student population, and therefore, the community

meet all conferencing commitments

structure my study with a clearly stated thesis statement

follow a well defined methodology for gathering quantifiable primary data...
questionnaire, poll, interviews, observations

express my findings on attractive, poster sized maps, charts or graphs and I display them in the assigned space

use graphics that have visual impact and I make creative use of space...arrangement, colour selection, lettering, computer graphic

draw insightful conclusions and make relevant predictions and recommendations

answer all questions about my research project with authority and confidence making appropriate reference to my thesis, method, findings and conclusions
Reflection

Reflection is severely under utilized. It becomes a casualty of curriculum coverage...too much to do, so little time. Yet there is no more powerful device in our repertoire for encouraging enduring learning. Many learning expectations or outcomes begin with the phrase, *demonstrate an understanding*. Reflection offers students the opportunity for significant “aha moments”. In reflection they can connect new learning to prior learning. They can evaluate new learning against personal experience. This is higher order thinking at its best, a process that can lead to understanding.

Good reflective questions can be much more powerful than a quiz in assessing student learning. Reflection can open the door to meaningful dialogue among students or between a student and teacher.

We must be very careful in assessing reflection because we are asking students to share their thoughts and feelings. In most cases, teachers should consider responding with questions and comments in a kind of dialogue with an implied invitation to open lines of communication. If the decision is made to assess reflection, it should be based on the students’ articulation of their thoughts and the quantity and quality of the support they offer for their thoughts.

Many opportunities for reflection are suggested in the following chapters. Just some of these are...

- Suggest four concrete actions you might take to keep your “village” safe ... Chapter 3
- Is Canada’s Immigration and Refugee policy fair to all? ... Chapter5
- How does it feel to be powerful/powerless ... a response to tableaux simulations ... Chapter 6
- A reflective analysis of the *Forum For Young Voices* ... Chapter 8
- Why is the issue of *Human Rights* critical in my life? ... Chapter 9

The scale on page __ is one way to respond to a student reflection.

**Some Types of Reflection:**

- Metacognitive: I learn best when…; If I was given another opportunity to complete this task, I…; Our group would have worked more effectively if…; How do you feel about learning…?
- Open ended statements: As a result of calculating my ecological footprint, I…; If a refugee family moved in next door, I…; NIMBY is...
- Simulation or role play: If you were a resident of Kirkland Lake,…; As a Ford Motor employee, I…; You are a fifth generation fisherman on the Labrador coast. You have decided to accept the Federal Fisheries Department offer to buy back your license to fish. How do you feel about your decision?
- Moral questions: Should the Canadian government promote the sale of Canadian made tobacco products in the developing world? Should Canadians boycott sweatshop clothing and footwear?
- Point of view: I would be happy/unhappy about paying higher taxes to guarantee safe drinking water for Anyplace, Ontario; National parks should/should not be opened up for resource development.
- A metaphor: Create a metaphor for the concept of … development, foreign aid, leadership. Explain your metaphor.
Reflection

The reflection…

- is no more than two pages in length
- expresses personal thoughts, beliefs and feelings
- thoroughly supports personal thoughts, beliefs and feelings with relevant, specific examples including some from personal experience
- poses and pursues thoughtful questions
- makes predictions and/or recommendations
- is coherently and persuasively written using language correctly and effectively

Comments and suggestions:
Tests

Tests should provide students with an opportunity to demonstrate what they know. Can they apply the knowledge and skills that have been learned? Too often, tests are about repeating what has been taught, missing a great opportunity to test learning. For many students, tests have become high stakes events. If we truly want to know what students have learned by testing, we must craft our tests very carefully. Typical tests, even demanding ones, tend to overassess student knowledge and underassess student know-how with knowledge. ... What we really want to know is ... can the student use knowledge and resources effectively?

Consider the following criteria for test making.

Does your test/quiz have ...
• clearly written instructions?
• time guidelines for questions (if it’s a unit or full class period test)?
• a variety of types of questions...2 or 3 of fill blanks, multiple choice, matching, true/false, short answer (writing or sketch and label), a writing question (short essay, letter, editorial)?
• an absence of tricks?
• a significant percentage of the questions require higher order thinking?
• an opportunity for students to learn something new or extend existing knowledge, for example an opportunity to read a short new sight passage, use new statistics, analyse a document, photograph or map?
• a requirement for students to demonstrate learning in all four categories... content knowledge, inquiry, communication and application?
• some questions invite students to draw on real or imagined experience?
• a clear marking scheme?

Final Evaluation...Some Alternatives

Recently, we have been given options to a final examination as a means to end a course, alternatives that accommodate many more student learning styles and that encourage more teacher and student creativity. Final evaluation can now include an examination, a performance, an essay or project, a portfolio any one of which can be administered towards the end of a course. We have, and more significantly, students can have choices.

A Culminating Unit Built Into The Course

They…
• are complex authentic tasks with a high potential to engage students;
• provide students with an opportunity to apply geographic knowledge and understanding acquired in the course;
• extend student learning into new content areas;
• require students to demonstrate their ability to inquire;
• involve communication of their results;
• may offer some choice;
• may involve some personal action on the part of students
A Portfolio

Final evaluation portfolio assignments vary from the very simple to the quite complex. The portfolio can be a folder of student selected work collected over the course of the year/semester, or a collection with teacher or school mandates attached. All portfolios share the following characteristics:
- the focus is on student work and on tracking and improving performance;
- students collect samples of different types of work throughout the year/semester;
- opportunities are provided for students to review and improve their work;
- periodically, students are invited to reflect on items in their collection and the reflections are included in the portfolio;
- substitutions are allowed at any time;
- portfolios are the subject of student-teacher, and sometimes, student-parent-teacher conferences throughout the year/semester;
- portfolios can be electronic in whole or in part.

A Sample Final Evaluation Portfolio

Include at least 8 of the items listed below in your “show portfolio”. All * items must be included. Up to 12 additional items may be selected at your discretion. The portfolio must be suitably introduced and concluded. Each item will have a reflective caption. Your portfolio will be reviewed periodically in teacher-student conferences and it will be the subject of at least one parent conference. Available exemplars and the criteria and descriptors in the following rubric provide a clear indication of portfolio requirements.

• A well written paragraph defending a point of view;*
• A report or project using statistical data analysis;*
• An application using student generated photographs, maps, or illustrations;
• A critical review of a film and/or book relevant to an issue under study;
• A creative presentation of the solution to a problem *
• A critical review of useful web sites;
• An application of technology in a problem solving context;*
• A handout for an oral presentation;
  • An expository essay of at least 5 paragraphs;*

An Essay Or Report And Oral Presentation

Questions requiring students to synthesize important “messages” of the course are recommended as a viable final assessment. Asking students to present all or part of their answer orally provides other students and the teacher with an opportunity to ask questions that may allow students to demonstrate understanding. An activity like this also functions as an effective review. Some class time might be devoted to group brainstorming or coaching. A couple of sample questions follow.

• A number of serious national and global issues have been studied this year. As a result of our work, you might be quite optimistic or quite pessimistic about our prospects for the future. Decide which you are and write an essay of at least 5 paragraphs defending your point of view. Make specific reference to topics or
issues studied this year in your arguments and make recommendations in your conclusions. Present your essay to the class.

• In this course, you have been asked to conduct a number of inquiries and to develop your inquiry skills. Answer the following questions about conducting an inquiry:

  • Select the 5 most interesting issues studied this year. Justify your choice;
  • Describe the essential methodology involved in conducting an inquiry;
  • Select what you believe to be the most effective source of information you used in conducting research and justify your selection;
  • Name 3 different types of evidence you might use to develop an argument or point of view and provide an example of each;
  • What would you include in the conclusion to an inquiry?
  • Identify what you think is the most effective way to communicate the results of an inquiry. Justify your choice using an example;

A rating scale that might be used to evaluate the second question follows.
**A Rubric for a Portfolio…Final Evaluation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Level 4</th>
<th>Level 3</th>
<th>Level 2</th>
<th>Level 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td>The introduction is clear and complete. It establishes purpose, contents and order</td>
<td>Introduction is complete …purpose, contents, order</td>
<td>Introduction is almost complete</td>
<td>Introduction is incomplete; important elements are missing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All goals identified are appropriate for the learner</td>
<td>Most goals identified are appropriate for the learner</td>
<td>Some goals identified are appropriate for the learner</td>
<td>No learning goals are identified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The collection</strong></td>
<td>Selection includes more than 8 of the required items</td>
<td>Selection includes 8 of the required items</td>
<td>Selection includes 7 of the 8 required items</td>
<td>Selection includes fewer than 7 of the required items; some significant omissions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Optional items fully represent all aspects of the course; each has a strong rationale</td>
<td>Optional items represent all aspects of the course; each has an appropriate rationale</td>
<td>Optional items represent most aspects of the course; most have an appropriate rationale</td>
<td>Optional items represent part of the course; some have an appropriate rationale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Portfolio items clearly demonstrate growth in most identified goals</td>
<td>Portfolio items demonstrate growth in some identified goals</td>
<td>Portfolio items demonstrate some growth</td>
<td>Portfolio items demonstrate little growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insightful reflective comments are attached to all items</td>
<td>Reflective comments are attached to all items</td>
<td>Some personal comments are attached to most items</td>
<td>Some personal comments are attached to some items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Conclusion</strong></td>
<td>Conclusion reflects fully and insightfully on your learning style and growth in knowledge and skills</td>
<td>Conclusion offers some reflection on your learning style and growth in knowledge and skills</td>
<td>Conclusion offers little reflection on your learning style and growth in knowledge and skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Insightful, useful critical comments are offered on the portfolio process</td>
<td>Several useful critical comments are offered on the portfolio process</td>
<td>Some useful critical comments are offered on the portfolio process</td>
<td>Few useful critical comments are offered on the portfolio process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Conferencing and Presentation</strong></td>
<td>Conferences about your portfolio were arranged on your initiative at appropriate intervals</td>
<td>Conferences were easily arranged about your portfolio at appropriate intervals</td>
<td>Conferences were arranged with considerable difficulty at appropriate intervals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All questions about your work were answered completely and with confidence</td>
<td>Most questions about your work were answered completely and with confidence</td>
<td>Many questions about your work were answered with some confidence</td>
<td>Some questions about your work were answered with some confidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Your work is presented with poise and confidence at your parent conference; no prompting is required</td>
<td>Your work is presented with confidence at your parent conference; a minimum of prompting is required</td>
<td>Your work is presented at your parent conference; some prompting is required</td>
<td>Your work is presented at your parent conference; considerable prompting is required</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 1: Assessment tools for GMO Debate Project ... Anecdote 2

Observation Chart:
In the chart below, students receive ☐, ☐, or ☐ for each day of the project, numbered days 1-6. Students are shown their assessment at the beginning of the following lesson so they may improve their work.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Name</th>
<th>Listening</th>
<th>Sharing</th>
<th>Encouraging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
<td>1 2 3 4 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Special comments about any students:
Name: __________________

Final GMO Project Assessment

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Overall Group work: Listening</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sharing</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Encouraging</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Initial Notes (from folders)</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Final Debate Notes</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Debate</td>
<td>☻</td>
<td>☻</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments and Suggestions:
### Technical Skills (X2)

- Variety of sentence types used
- Sophisticated, effective and appropriate vocabulary used
- Flawless use of formal letter format
- Appropriate formal tone is used, yet letter is passionate and convincing
- Type-written without spelling or structural errors

### Creativity (X1)

- Use of creative language, such as metaphors, similes, etc. is extensive and effective

### Content (X4)

- Position on the issue is clearly and convincingly stated
- Strong, concrete support is provided for your position
- Is more than 250 words
References