

## OISE COUNCIL

February 22, 2023

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OISE COUNCIL, held on February 23, 2022 at 3:00 p.m.

### **Present:**

Prof. Erica Walker, Dean, Prof. Kang Lee, Chair, Niki Anastasakis, Prof. Andrew Campbell, Lara Cartmale, Prof. Charles Chen, Prof. Yiola Cleovoulou, Prof. Daniel Corral, Christine Corso, Dr. Valerie Damasco, Julia Duncan, Prof. Diane Farmer, Iman Fouad, Prof. Antoinette Gagné, Prof. Patricia Ganea, Prof. Rubén Gaztambide-Fernández, Justin Holloway, Helen Huang, Dr. Hilary Inwood, Prof. Arlo Kempf, Prof. Normand Labrie, Prof. Eric Lavigne, Rurui Liu, Prof. Amal Madibbo, Prof. Sofya Malik, Prof. Douglas McDougall, Prof. David Montemurro, Dr. Haesun Moon, Titilola Omotosho, Prof. Soudeh Oladi Ghadikolaei, Prof. Michele Peterson-Badali, Dr. Christina Phillips, Prof. Angela Pyle, Jeananne Robertson, Huda Salha, Prof. Creso Sá, Ghayas Shams, Henry Ssali, Prof. Tracy Solomon, Prof. Lana Stermac, Ana Tariq, Prof. Njoki Wane, Jenaya Webb, Desmond Wong, Prof. Earl Woodruff, Andrea Zdzylowski, Zian Zhang

### **Secretariat:**

Biljana Cuckovic (Secretary of OISE Council), Lisa Smith, Jennifer Tucker, Doug Ullrich

### **Guests:**

Rushain Abbasi, Miralla Alkji, Lynne Alexandrova, Ateeqa Arain, Tess Barclay, Prof. Clare Brett, Prof. Kathy Broad, Ai-Ri Brown, Mindy Harris, Sim Kapoor, Josie Lalonde, Denise Makovac, Prof. Sarfaroz Niyozov, Joseph Rotich, Leah Scherk, Latifa Soliman

### **Regrets:**

Sezen Atacan, Prof. Abigail Bakan, Prof. Joshua Barker (Dean, School of Graduate Studies), Prof. Elizabeth Buckner, Prof. Carol Campbell, Haliz Doskee, Dr. Barnabas Emenogu, Prof. Michel Ferrari, Prof. Meric Gertler (President), Prof. Whitneé Garrett-Walker, Prof. Roy Gillis, Dr. Sheldon Grabke, Prof. Linda Iwenofu, Prof. Kaja Jasinska, Yilun Jiang, Fadi Kayale, Kinza Khan, Perry King, Ana Luiza Lacerda, Prof. Emmanuelle Le Pichon-Vorstman, Terry Louisy, Prof. Carly Manion, Dr. Elisabeth Rees-Johnstone, Prof. Cheryl Regehr (Vice-President and Provost), Prof. Angela Vemic, Yang Zhang

---

### ***Acknowledgement of Traditional Land***

Professor Kang Lee, Chair of Council, welcomed members and guests to the third meeting of OISE Council in 2022-2023, and read the land acknowledgement statement.

#### **1. Opening Remarks**

The Chair extended a special welcome to Professor Erica Walker who joined the Council for the first time as a new Dean of OISE.

An overview of the Participation Guidelines for virtual meetings of OISE Council was provided.

## 2. Review of Agenda

The Agenda for the meeting was reviewed and accepted.

## 3. Review and Approval of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

The minutes of the December 14, 2022 meeting of OISE Council were approved with the correction to a student member's statement regarding the length of the Interim Dean's report on the OISE budget, and the correction of the title of a member's role within the OISE Library.

## 4. Chair's Report

The Chair reported on the Executive Committee meeting held on February 13, 2023 at which the Committee reviewed and approved the agenda and materials for today's meeting, discussed procedural matters, and agreed that onboarding and orientation would be helpful to provide in the fall term regarding roles and expectations for members and officers of the Council.

## 5. Dean's Report

Dean Walker commenced her report with gratitude for the many expressions of welcome and support that she received from members of the OISE community including students, faculty, staff, and alumni. She shared her enthusiasm for joining the institution that prides itself on self-governance and collaboration, where voices from multiple constituencies are valued and heard, and where members come together for meaningful dialogue and constructive debate regarding the Institute's work and mission. Building on her experiences as a student, faculty member, and educational leader, including a twenty-year career at Teachers College, Columbia University, the Dean shared her eagerness for working and learning with all members of the OISE community over the course of her tenure as Dean.

Since commencing her term in January 2023, the Dean met with many of the University's and OISE's academic leaders and administrators, as well as with students, faculty, and staff; attended several events; and had many informal conversations with members of the community, which provided opportunities to experience the energy and enthusiasm of colleagues at the Institute. The Dean also reflected on the work with her administrative team who, since the beginning of the academic year, have been supporting vital academic initiatives including her smooth transition into the role. She then reported on several ongoing initiatives.

***For Information:*** OISE CPL: Approved Not-For-Credit Certificate Programs

In accordance with the *University Policy on Certificates (For-Credit and Not-For-Credit)*, the Constitution, and the OISE Guideline for Approval of Non-credit Certificates, Dean Walker reported on the two approved Not-For-Credit certificates in Continuing and Professional learning: (1) Cultivating Inclusive Learning Environments; and (2) Workplace Learning: Advancing Organizational Learning and Development. Information on the rationale, target audience, delivery format, and learner assessment for the two certificates were provided in the materials for the meeting.

The Dean provided an update on the search for a new Chair of the Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning, and several ongoing faculty and administrative leadership searches. Since the beginning of her term, the Dean met with representatives of the departmental student associations, and participated in several University governance meetings including the February 16, 2023 meeting of the Committee of Academic Policy and Programs at which the follow up report to the 2020-2021 Provostial review of OISE was presented. She reported on several academic change proposals focused on program delivery mode changes that were moving through various stages of the consultations and governance approval processes, which will allow OISE to continue to have flexibility around online and in person teaching and learning. She expressed admiration for the care, the level of detail, and the consultative process the Associate Dean,

Programs and his team, including the Department Chairs, and faculty were committing to these important initiatives. The Dean further reported that the accreditation review of OISE's two graduate teacher education programs, the Master of Teaching and the Master of Arts in Child Study and Education, with the Ontario College of Teachers was ongoing; that the application for accreditation renewal was submitted on February 15, 2023, and that the site visit was scheduled for May 16 and 17, 2023. Regarding the existing decanal initiatives, the Dean participated in meetings with the Black Faculty Caucus, the Dean's Advisory Council on Indigenous Education, as well as the Sustainability and Climate Action Network. She also met with various partners from the broader education community including members of the Ontario Association of Deans of Education and the Association of Canadian Deans of Education. In addition to these responsibilities, the Dean noted that she has been engaged in listening, pondering questions, themes, and storylines emerging from her formal and informal conversations with members of the community, which are contributing to her knowledge and understanding about OISE, and will continue to inform her decision-making. She added that she will continue to engage in multiple forms of data collection including at the coming Dean's Wishes and Welcome event taking place in the OISE Library on March 2, 2023, and extended the invitation to the event to all members and guests in attendance. The event will not only allow the Dean to meet more members of the community, but will also be an opportunity to begin to create new stories together, and think about new academic priorities.

Dean Walker shared her broad vision for OISE including honouring the Institute's commitment to conducting dynamic and innovative research, improving teaching and educational practice, and connecting in creative ways to the community—all in service of more equitable and just education. She further shared what attracted her to OISE including scholars who engage in rigorous research that impacts schools and communities; the inter- and trans-disciplinary approaches to addressing critical questions, and the willingness to reimagine what is, and what can be. In her own scholarly work, Dean Walker engages in the exploration of histories of mathematics teaching and learning, and leverages those histories to inform new futures for mathematical belonging for all students, especially those who have been underserved. Wherever she is, she endeavours to learn histories, prominent and obscured, as they contribute to the narratives about what we do, and why; and help us move forward, address challenges, and craft new ideas and ways of learning, teaching, and doing research.

As Dean of OISE, Professor Walker hopes to facilitate and expand the Institute's excellent work, identify and enable new and emerging areas of scholarship, and leverage support and resources to advance OISE's mission for students, faculty, and staff, for the broader community, for Canada, and the world. The Dean invited members to stay tuned in the coming months regarding a number of initiatives, some of which have already begun, that will help her understand and advance the community members' hopes and dreams for OISE's future.

Turning to awards and honours, the Dean reported that Helen Huang received the inaugural Exemplary U of T Ambassador Award in recognition of her work as an exemplary CAO supporting OISE's academic mission, and that Professor Fikile Nxumalo of the Department of Curriculum, Teaching, and Learning received the Emerging Scholar Award from the Comparative and International Education Society through the African Diaspora SIG.

In closing, the Dean read the land acknowledgement written by Dawn Maracle.

Following the Dean's report, Justin Holloway, a student member of Council and the Executive moved a motion requesting the Dean to present the OISE Budget and its consultation process at the April 26 meeting of Council, and to commit to doing so on an annual basis before the budget is finalized and submitted. He noted that the motion was supported by the student members of Council. The Chair ruled the motion out of order stating that, given that there was no proposal to add the motion to the agenda during the "Review of Agenda" item, it was not appropriate to propose a motion for a vote after the Dean's report. Justin Holloway then said that he would like to challenge the Chair's ruling the motion out of order, which was rejected by the Chair who asked Holloway to wait until "Other Items", and then

move a motion to amend the agenda first, and – if approved by Council – to propose a motion of new business at that time in order to allow members and guests to reflect on and ask questions regarding the Dean’s report.

Henry Ssali, a student member of Council, welcomed the Dean and asked how she plans to work with the departmental student associations to respond to and advance student matters and enhance student experience at OISE. The Dean responded that she appreciated the opportunity to meet with the representatives of the departmental student association to learn more about the work and aspirations of OISE students, and that she is looking forward to opportunities to engage in further discussions through regular meetings with student leaders, but also through community activities which bring together students from beyond various governance bodies and associations.

The Chair’s ruling of the motion out of order was questioned again by Justin Holloway who was asked to remain silent unless he had any questions related to the Dean’s report, and was then prevented by the Chair from speaking further for breach of decorum.

## 6. Reports from Standing Committees

- A. Academic Programs** – Professor Montemurro, Chair of the Academic Programs Committee reported on the Committee’s proposals approved at the March 3, 2023 meeting, which included one minor modification proposal—change to an existing program, and eight new courses.

*For Information:* Minor Modification: Change to an Existing Program

- Language and Literacies Education, Field in Language Teaching – MEd

*For Information:* Minor Modifications: New Courses

- APD1270H Trauma Informed Interventions
- APD1274H Learning to Learn: Bridging Theory and Practice
- APD1276H Maximizing Learning: Understanding How Individuals and Groups Learn Best
- CTL1350H Exploring Children’s and Youth’s Digital Literacies in a Networked World
- JOI3049H Multilevel and Longitudinal Modelling in Educational Research (RM)
- LHA1013H Developing and Organizing People in Education
- LHA1043H Decolonizing and Antiracist Approaches to Educational Leadership
- LHA1120H Professions, Learning, and Work

In closing, Professor Montemurro noted that the Committee also reviewed a number of minor course changes approved at the departmental level that were reported to the Committee for information.

- B. Equity** – On behalf of Professor Emmanuelle Le Pichon-Vorstman, Chair of the Equity Committee, who was absent from the meeting, Miralla Alakji, Graduate Assistant supporting the work of the Equity Committee reported on the Committee’s discussions at the meeting held on February 7, 2023.

The Committee reflected on the organization of the annual OISE Black Faculty in Conversation event held on February 15, 2023; and discussed the need for an Equity, Diversity and Inclusion focused roundtable for the benefit of OISE departments and units wishing to demonstrate their efforts in implementing the EDI principles. Anticipated to take place in April, the purpose of the roundtable will be to encourage conversations between departments to further the implementation of EDI principles, and to enable a collective empowerment of EDI within OISE.

A question was raised whether the roundtable on EDI was a new initiative by the Committee. It was explained that the Committee has been planning this for a while as follow up to the Environmental Scan survey on EDI that was conducted last year. Helen Huang, CAO, the Dean’s designate on the Committee,

added that the Environmental Scan survey resulted in valuable data on EDI activities in various departments, and that the roundtable will be an opportunity for members of the departments and units to hear and learn from each other.

- C. Research** – Professor Rubén Gaztambide-Fernández, Chair of the Research Committee reported on the Committee’s discussions at the meeting held on January 25, 2023.

At the third meeting of the Research Committee, Jenaya Webb, Interim Director of OISE Library, presented on various supports and services for faculty research including individual consultations, support for T space, copyright, licensing information, access to research software and assistance with research data management. The Committee members were invited to provide feedback on suggestions for Library acquisitions. A member of the U of T Libraries (UTL) provided an update on acquiring a license to upgrade to the latest version of NVivo, which is used by many faculty members. The Committee also discussed the need for systematic communication regarding platforms and online resources for research data management that are acceptable from a security perspective, and consistent with the Research Ethics Board requirements. There was also a discussion and presentation on research data management resources provided by the UTL including the Digital Research Infrastructure Portal (DRIP), the UTL Research Data Management website, and the Data Management Plan checklist. The Committee further discussed resources for non-digital data, and the solutions for storing confidential and sensitive data. An update was also provided on conversations with research officers from the two local School Boards, the TDSB and YRDSB, regarding partnership engagement opportunities and connections between the Boards’ strategic priorities and OISE research. In closing, Professor Gaztambide-Fernández informed members of the approaching deadline for the Provost’s Postdoctoral Fellowship program, which provides funding for hiring postdoctoral fellows from underrepresented groups, specifically Indigenous to Turtle Island and Black researchers.

A question was raised regarding the distinction between confidential and highly confidential data. It was explained that there is no particular distinction as any data labelled confidential is treated equally; however, there may be a distinction regarding data that is both confidential and sensitive.

## **7. Sustainability and Climate Action Network (SCAN) Update**

Dr. Hilary Inwood provided a progress report on OISE’s Sustainability and Climate Action Plan. In 2022-2023, the focus is on amplifying faculty research that connects to Sustainability and Climate Action (S&CA) through the SCAN website, by featuring Spotlight on Research talks, planning video productions, and strengthening TDSB/OISE Action Research team. An update on OISE’s Sustainability Fund was provided highlighting its contributions to community engagement and outreach. The Fund will be open for a new round of applications in April. The SCAN continues to focus on embedding S&CA into OISE roles and responsibilities, improving spaces to support wellbeing, strengthening staff and faculty capacity in relation to climate justice and S&CA, and expanding OISE’s capacity for research in this area. Dr. Inwood reported that OISE’s work on this front is gaining support from the University, which recently announced the introduction of a carbon offsetting program for U of T-funded air travel, charging a fee for every kilometre flown and reinvesting that money into projects that lower campus emissions and provide other sustainability benefits.

## **8. Other items**

The Chair invited the student member who had initiated the motion following the Dean’s report, if still interested, to propose to amend the agenda first, followed by a motion of new business if approved.

There was a discussion regarding the process for moving timely motions, as well as the motion itself as a method to facilitate the students’ request for more information on the OISE budget. The Secretary noted that the wording of the motion was not aligned with the Constitution and University policy; since Council

plays an advisory role to the Dean, Council does not have the authority to order the Dean to do something that falls within the powers and duties of the Dean. Professor Peterson-Badali noted that, regardless of whether the method for raising this issue was appropriate, it appears that the overall intent on the part of students is to have more information and input into the budget process. Professor Campbell, also a member of the Executive, added that it would be beneficial for members to have guidelines about the meeting process, which could be accomplished through the onboarding that members of the Executive Committee discussed at the Executive Committee meeting. The Chair commented that protocols for running governance meetings vary across institutions depending on institutional customs and norms, and agreed that establishing an annual onboarding session, likely at the first meeting of Council, will be helpful. The Chair further noted that proposing motions and agenda items to Council is possible via the Executive (as the agenda setting committee of Council), as well as during meetings (by proposing to amend the agenda in order to introduce a motion of new business), which helps to preserve the sequence of the agenda.

A question was raised regarding the purpose of “Other Items” and why timely motions cannot be proposed without proposing to amend the agenda first. The Chair explained that under “Other items”, members are invited to share information and brief updates on matters of interest to Council, and that introduction of motions of new business for a vote should be done by moving a motion to amend the agenda first, ideally under the “Review of Agenda” item at the beginning of a meeting.

As a former Chair of Council, Professor Woodruff, confirmed that it is not appropriate to introduce a motion to Council without either putting it forward to the Executive in advance or putting forward a motion to amend the agenda first at the meeting. The only exception is a motion to adjourn. The reason for this rule is to allow members ample time to consider motions, such as those regarding budget, which are often complex and need to be considered carefully. Professor Woodruff also noted that it is possible to foreshadow a motion without amending the agenda by informing Council that a motion will be forthcoming at a future meeting. He added that, in the case of the particular motion under discussion, it appears that the goal of the motion could be accomplished by making a comment and asking a question of the Dean rather than formulating it as a motion for a vote, especially given the Council’s advisory role to the Dean.

A staff member of Council, Lara Cartmale, commented that OISE is known for encouraging student voices in an orderly manner; however, the respect for the role of Chair and encouraging student engagement are not mutually exclusive, and that it would be helpful for the Executive to discuss how to ease some of the tension that often materializes in Council meetings. A student member, Henry Ssali, agreed with the Chair in terms of how the meeting was being conducted, and added that, given the Dean’s authority over the budget and resources, it would not be appropriate for Council to mandate the Dean to commit to presenting the budget.

Helen Huang, CAO, clarified that, at the previous Council meeting, the budget overview was one of the items included in the Dean’s report, and that it was not a dedicated budget presentation.

Given his governance expertise, a question was raised of Professor Woodruff regarding the process for challenging the Chair, and whether timely motions can be raised under other business. Professor Woodruff explained that the Chair’s duties are outlined in the rules of order, and that one needs to be familiar with these duties to challenge the Chair’s ruling about a certain proceeding. A motion to challenge the Chair needs to be seconded, debated, and decided by the majority of members present and voting. Regarding timely motions, Professor Woodruff noted that these can be made under other business by amending the agenda to include them. He added that some matters can go directly to a motion, while some can have a debate first. He noted that the Chair was providing a space for this discussion to take place, which, under a strict formalization of the meeting rules, would not have been allowed.

Following this discussion, a motion was moved to amend the agenda to include a motion supported by student members of Council, amended to align with the Constitution and the University policy, requesting

the Dean to present the OISE Budget and its consultation process at the next meeting of Council, and to consider doing so on an annual basis. This motion was seconded by another student member, and with the majority in favour, four abstentions, and one opposed; the motion to amend the agenda was carried.

The motion was read again in full and was seconded by a student member. A follow up question was raised regarding changes to the wording of the motion in order to bring it into alignment with the Constitution and the University policy, and it was confirmed that these changes were made. Lara Cartmale, a staff member of Council, commented that while the intent of the motion is clear, it is difficult to overlook the negativity in the motion concerning the former Interim Dean's work during a challenging time of the pandemic, which does not contribute to the motion. She then noted that she would support the motion with the removal of these connotations. Justin Holloway agreed to a minor amendment that did not entirely remove the reference to the former Interim Dean. Professor Campbell noted that this was an example of why motions of this kind should be taken to the Executive so that they can be properly discussed before they are brought forward to Council. Professor Campbell added that, while he understands the intent of the motion and the need to consult with students, he does not support making a motion to the new Dean to report to Council in a certain way that would represent a precedent and a departure from the usual norms. Professor McDougall supported the suggestion to remove the reference to the former Interim Dean from the motion, which was also supported by several members including Professor Madibbo who stated that no mention should be made of the previous Dean except to thank them for their service to OISE. Professor Madibbo also supported Professor Campbell's position that the Council should not request anything from the Dean that was not requested of previous Deans. The mover agreed to remove the second paragraph from the motion, and the motion was amended as follows:

Whereas the U of T Provost's website (<https://memos.provost.utoronto.ca/the-budget-process-an-overview-2/>) indicates main principles to a budget's success include "Transparency" and "Engagement (consultation and review processes)" and that each year "Deans and their staff members consult at the local level" as part of the budget process.

Therefore, be it resolved that the current OISE Dean, Erica Walker, consider revisiting, presenting, and explaining the OISE Budget submission and its consultation process in greater detail at the April 26<sup>th</sup>, 2023 OISE Council meeting, and consider doing so on a yearly basis with broad OISE community consultation before the OISE budget is finalized and submitted.

Professor Peterson-Badali noted that, while she supports the idea of openness and information sharing regarding the budget, she will vote against the motion as it is not certain that this is the right way to achieve it. Professor Woodruff noted that he supports the motion as amended as it seeks transparency typically met by the OISE administration.

Of the 44 voting members present, 21 voted in favour of the motion, 10 voted against the motion<sup>1</sup>, five abstained from voting, and eight did not cast their vote. The motion was carried.

Dean Walker expressed appreciation for the conversation stating that her leadership practice has always been collaborative and consultative, and that this will continue at OISE. She added that she welcomes everyone's suggestions and ideas in the constructive spirit in which they are meant, and that she is looking forward to continuing to work together with members of the community with shared understanding. She thanked members and guests for welcoming her, and for their contributions to OISE.

## **9. Adjournment**

The Chair thanked all members and guests for their contributions, and adjourned the meeting at 4:57 p.m.

---

<sup>1</sup> Including a vote by a member who attended the meeting via phone and cast their vote via email to "OISE Council" following the meeting in accordance with the Participation Guidelines for virtual meetings of OISE Council.